

K Ufi a 'gc``hYb 'G]Y 'gW k Yf '\ YVYb

K U\bg]bb 'k]fX 'cZh'gc 'VYgW f]YVYbž'XUgg 'Yf']a a Yf'k]YXYf
XUggY`VY 'hi h'i bX 'XYbbcW i b hYfgW]YX`]W Y '9f[YVb]ggY
Yfk UfhYh' '8]YgY '8 YZ]b]h]cb '_Øbb hY 'ZØf'j]Y`Y 'hfUX]h]cbY`Y
:]hb YggVY [Y]ghYfhY [Y`hYbž'X]Y 'gY]h'J\ fYb 'XUggY`VY
HfU]b]b[gdfc[fUa a 'UVgc'j]YfYb 'i bX 'g]W 'ZfU[Ybž'k Ufi a 'g]Y
_Y]bY '9f[YVb]ggY 'a Y\ f'Yfn]Y`Yb" '8 Ug'U`[Ya Y]bY
5bdUggi b[ggmbXfc a 'VYgW fY]Vh'k]Y 'XYf'a YbgW ']W Y
?ØfdYf'Ui Z'Y]bYb 'HfU]b]b[gfY]n'fYU[]Yfh" '9g' []Vh'X]Y
GW cW_d\UgYž]b 'XYf'XYf'HfU]b]b[gfY]n'ni a 'YfghYb 'A U'
Ub[Yk YbXYh'k]fX" '8 UfUb 'gW ']Y» h'g]W 'Y]bY
5bdUggi b[gd\UgY'j cb 'i b[YZA\ f'UW h'V]g '%& 'K cW Yb 'Ubž']b
XYf'XYf'?ØfdYf'Ua 'ghAf_ghYb 'Ui Z'XYb 'HfU]b]b[gfY]n'fYU[]Yfh"
8]Yg'ZØ\ fh'ni f'9fgW ØdZi b[gd\UgYž'k Ybb 'XUg
HfU]b]b[gdfc[fUa a 'b]W h'a Y\ f'XYb '[Yk ØbgW hYb '9ZZY_h
\Uh" '8]Yg' / Ua d\AY`d/



K U\bg]bb 'k]fX 'cZh'gc 'VYgW f]YVYbž'XUgg 'Yf']a a Yf'k]YXYf
XUggY`VY 'hi h'i bX 'XYbbcW i b hYfgW]YX`]W Y '9f[YVb]ggY 'Yfk UfhYh"

8]YgY'8YZ]b]h]cb'_Obb hY'ZOf'j]Y`Y'hfUX]h]cbY``Y':]hb YggVY[Y]ghYfhY
[Y`hYbZ]X]Y'gY]h]U\ fYb'XUggY`VY'HfU]b]b[gdfc[fUa a'UVgc'j]YfYb
i bX'g]W\ ZFU[YbZk Ufi a'g]Y'_Y]bY'9f[YVb]ggY'a Y\ f'Yfn]Y`Yb"

8Ug'U``[Ya Y]bY'5bdUggi b[ggmbXfca'VYgW\ fY]VhZ'k]Y'XYf
a YbgW\]W\ Y'?OfdYf'Ui Z'Y]bYb'HfU]b]b[gfY]n'fYU[]YfH''9g'[]Vh'X]Y
GW\ cW_d\UgYz]b'XYf'XYf'HfU]b]b[gfY]n'ni a'YfghYb'A U'
Ub[Yk YbXYh'k]fX''8UfUb'gW\]Y'h'g]W\ 'Y]bY'5bdUggi b[gd\UgY
j cb'i b[YZA\ f'UW\ h'V]g'%&K cW\ Yb'UbZ]b'XYf'XYf'?OfdYf'Ua
ghA_f_ghYb'Ui Z'XYb'HfU]b]b[gfY]n'fYU[]YfH''8]Yg'Z\ f\ ni f
9fgW\ OdZ b[gd\UgYz]k Ybb'XUg'HfU]b]b[gdfc[fUa a'b]W\ h'a Y\ f
XYb'[Yk ObgW\ hYb'9ZZY_h'\Uh''8]Yg']ghX]Y'[fi bX`Y[YbXY
K]ggYbgW\ UZh'\]bhYf'XYf'DYf]cX]g]Yfi b[z'VY]XYf'X]Y
HfU]b]b[g]bhYbg]hA_h'fY[Y'a A\][i bX'gmghYa Uh]gW\ 'Ub[YdUggh
k]fXz'i a'D'UhYUi g'ni'j Yfa Y]XYb"

9]b'g]W\ YfYf'K Y[z'Y]b'D'UhYUi'ni'Xi fW\ VfYW\ YbZ'VYghY\ h'XUf]bZ
Y]b][Y'cXYf'U``Y'J Uf]UV'Yb']a'HfU]b]b[gdfc[fUa a'ni'AbXYfb"
8]YgY'J Uf]UV'Yb'i a ZUggYb.'HfU]b]b[gUi gk U\`z'bhYbg]hA_hZ
K]YXYf\c'i b[YbZG\hnyZ'F i \Y]bhYfj U``z'HYa dc
f\Yk Y[i b[g[YgW\ k]bX][_Y]h\ i bX'<\Ai Z][_Y]h'f5bnU\ ``XYf
HfU]b]b[gY]b\Y]hYb']b'Y]bYa'VYgh]a a hYb'NY]hUi a \t' i a'ZUgh
gcZcfh][Y'J YfAbXYfi b[Yb']b'\fYa'?OfdYf'ni'gh]a i'YfYbZ
Yf\O\Yb'G]Y'XUg'; Yk]W\ hfk cXi fW\ X]Y'bhYbg]hA_h'Yf\O\h'k]fX\Z
XUg'G]Y']b'\fYa' HfU]b]b[j Yfk YbXYb''K Ybb'G]Y'ZYghghY``YbZ'XUgg
G]Y'_Y]bY'; Yk]bbY'Yfn]Y'Yb'cXYf'Y]bZUW\ bi f'Y]b'UbXYfYg
HfU]b]b[gdfc[fUa a'k ObgW\ YbZ'_Obb Yb'G]Y'a]h\]ZY'j cb'gYW\ g
A O[']W\ _Y]hYb'a]h'gW\ k YfYb'; Yk]W\ hYb'X]Y'YbXYfi b[Yb
j cfbY\ a YbZ'X]Y'G]Y']b'\fYa'?OfdYf'gY\ Yb'a O\W\ hYb"



%'''GW\ k YfYg'<YVYb'_Ubb'XUni'Z\ fYbZ'XUgg
A i g_Y`b'k UW\ gYb"

GhUf_Yf'K]XYfghUbX'_Ubb'a Y\ f'A i g_Y'ZUgYfb'j ca' Hmd'=
fY_fi h]YfYb'i bX'Ub[fY]ZYbZ'X]Y'ZOf'X]Y'9fnYi [i b[j cb'A i g_Y'_fUZh
j YfUbhk cfh]W\ g]bX''K Ybb'G]Y'Y]b'gW\ k YfYg'; Yk]W\ h\YVYbZ

_ÒbbYb`G]Y`gdØfYbžk]Y`ΔfY`A i g_Y`b`n]hhYfb"“8]Yg``]Y[h`XUfUbž
XUgg`Δf`B Yfj YbgmghYa `XUfUb`UfVY]hYhža Y\fa chcf]gWX Y
9]b\Y]hYb`i bX`A i g_Y`ZUgYfb`ni `U_hj]YfYbži a `X]Y`?fUZh`ni
YfnYi [YbžX]Y`ni a `6Yk Y[Yb`Y]bYg`; Yk]WX hg`YfZcfXYf`]WX`]gh` Hmd!
=A i g_Y`ZUgYfb`g]bX`]a `5`[Ya Y]bYb`ZØf`X]Y` fØ» Y`i bX`8YZ]b]h]cb
Y]bYg`A i g_Y`g`j YfUbhk cfh]WX“K Ybb`G]Y`U`gc`a Y\f`X]YgYf`; UgYfb
U_hj]YfYbž_ÒbbYb`G]Y`gcZcfh][Y`9f[YVb]ggY`Yfn]Y`Yb“

&“`GXW k YfYg`<YVYb`j YfVYggYfh`X]Y
]bhfUa i g_i `ÀfY`?ccfX]bUh]cbžk Ug`ZØf`X]Y
J YfVYggYfi b[`XYf`; YgUa h_fUZh`k]WX h][`]gh“

=bhYfa i g_i `ÀfY`?ccfX]bUh]cb`]gh`X]Y` : À\][_Y]h`Y]bYf`F Y]\Y
j YfgWX]YXYbYf`A i g_Y`UVgWX b]hhYžni gUa a Ybni UfVY]hYbži a `Y]bY
6Yk Y[i b[`Yfj cfni fi ZYb“=bhfUa i g_i `ÀfY`?ccfX]bUh]cb`]gh`X]Y
: À\][_Y]h`XYf`: UgYfbžUi g`XYbYb`Y]b`VYgh]a a hYf`A i g_Y`VYghY\hž
ni gUa a Ybni UfVY]hYbži a `Y]bY`?fUZh`ni `YfnYi [Yb“8U`X]Y
?cbhfU_h]cb`Y]bYg`A i g_Y`g`a Y\f`?fUZh`YfZcfXYfhž`_Ubb`X]Y
J Yfk YbXi b[`Y]bYg`ghUf`Yb`K]XYfghUbXg`X]Y`]bhfUa i g_i `ÀfY
?ccfX]bUh]cb`]b`Y]bYa `VYgh]a a hYb`A i g_Y`UVgWX b]hhj YfVYggYfbž
k cXi fWX`G]Y`Ui WX`YZZ]n]YbhYf`?fUZh`YfnYi [Yb`_ÒbbYb“

“`GXW k YfYg`<YVYb`_Ubb`XUni`VY]hfU[Ybž
XUgg`X]Y`A i g_Y`b`ghÀf`Yf`k YfXYbžc\`bY
[fØ» Yf`ni `k YfXYb“

8]Y`gUf_cd`Uga Uh]gWX Y`<mdYfhfc d\]Y`VYgWX fY]Vhžk]Y`g]WX`XUg
GUf_cd`Uga U`Y]bYg`A i g_Y`g`j Yf[fØ» Yfhžk Ybb`; Yk]WX hY`a]h
a `À»][Yf`V]g`c\Yf`bhYbg]hÀh`ZØf`Y]bY`\Ø\YfY`5bnU\`j cb
K]YXYf\c`i b[Yb`fh“6“%\$`V]g`%) £`Ub[Y\cVYb`k YfXYb“8]Y
a mcZ]Vf`ÀfY`<mdYfhfc d\]Y`VYgWX fY]Vhžk]Y`A i g_Y`ZUgYfb`U`g
FYU_h]cb`Ui Z?fUZh hfU]b]b[`X]WX_Yf`i bX`X]WX hYf`k YfXYb“8]Y
J Yfk YbXi b[`gWX k YfYf`; Yk]WX hY`_cbnYbhf]Yfh`g]WX`Ui ZX]Y
a mcZ]Vf`ÀfY`<mdYfhfc d\]Yhžk Ug`ni `A i g_Y`b`ZØ\fhžX]Y`X]WX_Yf`i bX
ghÀf`Yf`g]bXžUVYf`b]WX h`i bVYX]b[h`[fØ» Yf“K Ybb`G]Y`Y]bY
cdh]a U`Y`A Yb[Y`Ub`gWX k YfYa`K]XYfghUbX`Ub\YVYbžgc`hYb`G]Y

bi f'ZØbZ'cXYf'k Yb][Yf'K]YXYf\c`i b[Yb'Ui gZØ\fYb' _ØbbYbž
k Å\fYbX'G]Y'Y]bY'[i hY': cfa 'VY]VY\U'hYb"

("·8Ug'<YVYb'gW k YfYf'; Yk]W hY'_Ub b'XUni
VY]hfU[Ybž'Δf'V]c`c[]gW Yg'5`hYf'ni
j Yff]b[Yfb"

K Ybb'G]Y'ØVYf'') ·U\fY'U'h'g]bXž'gc``hYb'G]Y'Ui Z'YXYb': U``nk Y]!
V]g'j]Yfa U'dfc'K cW Y'ØVYf'Y]bYb'NY]hfUi a'j cb'Yk Y]g'j]Yf'V]g
UW h'K cW Yb'YI hfYa'ghUf_Yb'K]XYfghUbX'Ubk YbXYb''K Ybb
Yfk UW gYbY'A ÅbbYf'A]hhY' \$'g]bXž'dfcXi n]YfYb'g]Y'bUhØf']W
k Yb][Yf'HYghcghYfcbž'Yg'gY]XYbbž'Yg'[]Vh'Y]bYb'F Y]nž'XYf'XYb
?ØfdYf'XUni j YfUb'Ugghž'Yg'ni'dfcXi n]YfYb''HYghcghYfcb']gh'Y]b
GhYfc]X\cfa cb'i bX'j YfUbhk cfh]W ZØf'X]Y'FYdUfUhi f
VYgW AX][hYf'A i g_Y'ZUgYfbž'X]Y'X]Y'; fØ» Y'i bX'?fUZh'Y]bYg
A i g_Y'g'ghY][Yfb' _ØbbYb''G W k YfYg'?fUZhhfU]b]b[']gh'Y]bY'5fh'j cb
Gh]a i 'i gž'XYf'XUni ZØ\fYb' _Ubbž'XUgg'A ÅbbYf'HYghcghYfcb
dfcXi n]YfYb'i bX'ni f'9f\Ø'i b['XYf'?bcW YbX]W hY'VY]hfU[Yb"
6Y]XY'g]bX'k]W h][Y'A Uf_Yf'ZØf'XUg'V]c`c[]gW Y'5`hYf''G W k YfYg
?fUZhhfU]b]b['_Ubb'Ui W : fUi Yb'ØVYf'') '\Y'ZYbž']\fYb
K UW ghi a g\cfa cbgd]Y[Y'ni 'Yf\Ø\Ybž'k Ug'ZØf'X]Y'9bhk]W_i b[
j cb'A i g_Y'a UggY'i bX'X]Y'; Yhhj YfVfYbbi b['k]W h]['gh"

) "·GW k YfYg'<YVYb' _Ub b'\Y'ZYbž'Δf'Yb
F i \YghcZZk YW gY'ni 'ghY][Yfb"

9]b'DZ bX'G_Y'Yhha i g_Y'j YfVfUi W h]b'F i \Y'i b[YZA\f') 'V]g'+
?U'cf]Yb'dfc'HU["·8Ug'<]bni ZØ[Yb'j cb') 'V]g'+DZ bX'A i g_Y'b
_Ubb'Δf'Yb'F i \YghcZZk YW gY'fk]Y'YZZ]n]Ybh'Δf'?ØfdYf'9bYf[]Y
dfcXi n]Yfhi bX'j YfVfUi W h'Ui ZV]g'ni ') \$'?U'cf]Yb'dfc'HU[
ghY][Yfb'·8Ug'\Øfh'g]W j]Y'Y]W h'b]W h'j]Y'Ubž'UVYf']a '@Ui ZY
Y]bYg'U\fYg'Ybhgd]W h'X]Yg'Y]bYa'I bhYfgW]YX'j cb'i b[YZA\f
nk Y]8f]hhY'b'Y]bYg'DZ bXg': Yhhž'XUg'G]Y'j YfVfYbbYb' _ØbbYbž
k Ybb'G]Y'UVgc'i h'b]W hg'hi b"

* "·K Ybb'Xi 'gW k YfYg'NYi ['\YVghž'g]Y\gh'Xi

k]f_`]W\`Wc c`Ui g"

8 Ug[]Vh`X]f`dfU\`Yf]gW\`F YW\hY`i b hYf`XY]bYb`fYi bXYb"8Yf
B UW\hY]`gh\`XUgg`G]Y`a Y\`f`5bZfU[Yb`\UVYb\`fYi bXYb`cXYf`XYf
: Ua `]Y`VY]a `I a ni [`j cb`A ØVY`b`ni `Y`ZYb\`UVYf`XUg`gh`bi f`XYf
DfY]g\`XYb`G]Y`nU\`Yb`a ØggYb\`i a ``ÀW\`Yf]W\`ghUf`ni `gY]b"



8]Y`J Yfk YbXi b[`Y]bYg`gh\`f`YfYb`K]XYfghUbXg`_Ubb
Y]bgW\ØW\hYfbX`gY]b\`XU`Yf`j]Y`gW\k]Yf][Yf`]gh`i bX`X]Y`Ui g[YØVhY
? fUZh`A i g_Y`gW\ÀXYb`j Yfi fgUW\h`fB]Yg`]gh`Y]bY`XYf
A Ø[`]W\`Y]hYb\`k]Y`A i g_Y`b`k UW\gYb" `I a `a Y\`f`ØVYf`XUg
A i g_Y`k UW\ghi a `ni `YfZU\`fYb\`_]W\`Yb`G]Y`Yf\`9]bY
B YVYbk]f_i b[`XYg`<YVYbg`j cb`gW\k YfYa `A i g_Y`_UhYf`fB C A G\`
]gh`Y]b`j YfnØ[YfhYf`A i g_Y`_UhYf`K Ybb`G]Y`Ya U`g`8CA G`[YZØ\`h
\UVYb\`k]ggYb`G]Y\`k]Y`i bUb[YbY\`a `Yg`gY]b`_Ubb"9g`gW\Y]bh
nk Uf`b]W\h`]bhi]hjj `ni `gY]b\`Y]W\hY`5_hjj]h\`hYb`Ui gni ZØ\`fYb\`k Ybb
G]Y`k i bX`g]bX\`UVYf`Yg`_Ubb`A`bYb`Y`ZYb\`g]W\`gW\`bY`Yf`ni
Yf\`c`Yb\`k cXi fW\`G]Y`XUg`Ø\`Yf`HfU]b]b[gj c`i a Yb`Ui gZØ\`fYb
_ObbYb\`XUg`ZØf`XYb`A i g_Y`Ui ZUUi `i bX`X]Y`J Yf\`AbXYfi b[`XYg
? ØfdYfg`YfZcfXYf`]W\`]gh"

A UgW\`bY`Yg`HfU]b]b[`_Ubb`XYf`g]W\`YfghY`5b gUhn`ZØf`X]Y
J Yfk YbXi b[`YI hfYa`gW\k YfYf`Yk]W\`hY`gY]b`I a `X]Y`VYghYb
9f[YVb]ggY`ni `Yfn]Y`Yb\`gc`hYb`G]Y`Yk]W\`hY`j Yfk YbXYb\`X]Y`ZØbZ
K]YXYf\`c`i b[Yb`i b[`Ui V`]W\`YfUi gZcfXYfb`fG]Y`gc`hYb`_Y]bY
gYW\ghY`K]YXYf\`c`i b[`Xi fW\ZØ\`fYb`_ObbYb\`i bX`A`f`Dfc`fUa`a
bUW\`%`cXYf`%`K cW\`Yb`AbXYfb\`XUa]h`G]Y`XYb`FY]n`ZØf`A`f`Yb
? ØfdYf`AbXYfb`K Ybb`G]Y`g]W\`YfghY`Yb`a ØW\hYb\`XUgg`G]Y`X]Y
VYghYb`9f[YVb]ggY`Ui g`A`f`Yf`NY]h`]a `:]hbYggghi X]c`Yfn]Y`Yb\`
gc`hYb`G]Y`Y]bYb`579!nYfh]Z]n]YfhYb`DYfgc`bU`HfU]bYf`VYUi`Zh`U[Yb\`
i a `A`f`Dfc`fUa`a`gc`Ubni dUggYb\`XUgg`G]Y`g]W\`Yf`g]bX\`k Ybb`G]Y
XYb`j cb`A`bYb`j Yfk YbXYhYb`K]XYfghUbX`Yf\`Ø\`Yb"



≠gd]f]Yfh'j cb'579

8 YhU]`g

6 Ygi WX Yb 'G]Y 'i bg'Ui Z. 'a Y]b!Z]hb Ygg"b Yh