

K]Y`a Ub`@YVYbga]hhY`j Yfk YbXYhž`i a 5 b[gh`ni ``]bXYfb

: Øf`j]Y`Y`A YbgW`Yb`]gh`XYf`GhfYgg`Ui Z`Y]bYa `5``nY]h\cW`"
C V`k c`\`k]f`X]Y`GhfYggei Y``Yb`b]W`h`j c``gh`ÅbX][`Ui g`i bgYfYa
`@YVYb`YbhZYfbYb`_`ÖbbYbž`_`ÖbbYb`k]f`K Yf_nYi [Y`i bX
HYW`b]_Yb`Z]bXYbž`X]Y`i bg`\Y`ZYbž`XYb`GhfYgg`VYggYf`ni
VYk `À`h][Yb``8]Y`J YfVYggYfi b[`XYf`GW``UZ[Yk c`\b`Y]hYbž`X]Y
GhY][Yfi b[`XYf`_`ÖfdYf`W`Yb`5`_h]j]h`Åhž`XUg`, VYb`j cb
5W`hgUa _Y]hi bX`XUg`HfYbbYb`j cb`B`UW`f]W`hYb`cXYf
gc]U`Yb`A`YX]Yb`_`ÖbbYb`XYZ]b]h]j `Y]bYb`[fc»Yb`6Y]hfU[`ni f
F`YXi n]Yfi b[`j cb`GhfYgg``Y]ghYb``i bX`k]Y`X]YgYf`5fh]_Y`
Yf`_`Äfhž`_`Ubb`X]Y`Y`bXYfi b[`≠fYf`9gg[Yk c`\b`Y]hYb`Ui W`
Y]bYb`[fc»Yb`6Y]hfU[`ni f`6Yk `À`h][i b[`≠fYg`GhfYgg]j YUi g
`Y]ghYb``Ni b`ÅW`gh`a`i`gg`ZYgh[YghY``h`k YfXYbž`XUgg`_Y]bY
`@YVYbga]hhY`5b[gh`j Yfi fgUW`Yb`cXYf`j Yf\]bXYfb``8]Y
: cfgW`i b[`_Ubb`i bg]a` /`Ua`d`Λ`Y``]d/`



: Øf`j]Y`Y`A YbgW`Yb`]gh`XYf`GhfYgg`Ui Z`Y]bYa `5``nY]h\cW`"
C V`k c`\`k]f`X]Y`GhfYggei Y``Yb`b]W`h`j c``gh`ÅbX][`Ui g`i bgYfYa
`@YVYb`YbhZYfbYb`_`ÖbbYbž`_`ÖbbYb`k]f`K Yf_nYi [Y`i bX`HYW`b]_Yb`Z]bXYbž`
X]Y`i bg`\Y`ZYbž`XYb`GhfYgg`VYggYf`ni `VYk `À`h][Yb``8]Y
J YfVYggYfi b[`XYf`GW``UZ[Yk c`\b`Y]hYbž`X]Y`GhY][Yfi b[`XYf`

_ÖfdYf`jWXYb`5_h]j]hÄhž`XUg` , VYb`j`cb`5W`hgUa`_Y]h`i`bX`XUg`
HfYbbYb`j`cb`B`UW`f]W`hYb`c`XYf`gcn]U`Yb`A`YX]Yb`_ÖbbYb`XYZ]b]h]j
Y]bYb`[`fc»`Yb`6Y]hfU[`ni`f`FYXi`n]Yfi`b`[`j`cb`GhfYgg`Y]ghYb`"i`bX`
k`j]X]YgYf`5fh]_Y`Yf`_Äfhž`_Ubb`X]Y`Y`bXYfi`b`[`≠`fYf`
9gg[`Yk`c`b`b`Y]hYb`Ui`W`Y]bYb`[`fc»`Yb`6Y]hfU[`ni`f`6Yk`Ä`h][`i`b`[
≠`fYg`GhfYgg]j`YUi`g`Y]ghYb`"

Ni`bÄW`gh`a`i`gg`ZY`gh[`Y`ghY`h`k`YfXYbž`XUgg`_Y]bY`@YVYbga`]hhY`
5b[`gh]`Yfi`fgUW`Yb`c`XYf`j`Yf`bXYfb`"8]Y`:`c`fgW`i`b`[`_Ubb`i`bg]a`
5`[`Ya`Y]bYb`a`Y`f`XUfØVYf`YfnÄ`Yb`J`YfVÄ`bXY`Y`Yf`U`g`
I`fgUW`Yb`/A`h`UbXYfYb`K`c`fhYbž`Yg`_Ubb`i`bg`gU[`Ybž`XUgg`XUg`
9ggYb`c`XYf`J`Yfa`Y]XYb`VYgh]a`a`hYf`@YVYbga`]hhY`a`Y`f`c`XYf`
k`Yb][`Yf`a`]h`5b[`gh]`YfVi`bXYb`gY]b`_Ubb`"

8`UfØVYf`b]bUi`g`k`j]f`_Yb`g]W`X]Y`@YVYbga`]hhY`ž`X]Y`G]Y`fY[`Y`a`Ä»][`
_cbgi`a`]YfYbž`Y`Yf`Ui`Z`XUg`5b[`ghb]j`YUi`Ui`g`U`g`Y`XY`Y]bnY`bY`
A`U`n`Y]h`"cbg]ghYb`hYž`dcg]h]j`Y`9fb`Ä`fi`b`[`g[`Yk`c`b`b`Y]hYb`k`j]X]Y`
6Y[`fYbni`b`[`j`cb`ž`b`!`:`ccXž`XYf`?`cbgi`a`j`cb`Ui`gfY]W`Yb`X`
J]hUa`]b`8`i`bX`C`a`Y[`U!`!fY]W`Yb`@YVYbga`]hhY`bž`Y]bY`
UVk`YW`g`i`b`[`gfY]W`Y`9fb`Ä`fi`b`[`ž`XUg`?`cW`Yb`Y][`YbYf`
@YVYbga`]hhY`i`bX`XUg` , VYb`j`cb`5W`hgUa`_Y]h`VY]a`9ggYb`_ÖbbYb`
XUg`5b[`ghb]j`YUi`i`bX`X]Y`U`[`Ya`Y]bY`Gh]a`a`i`b`[`Yf`YV`]W`
j`YfVYggYfb`"8`U`Yf`k`j]f`X`Y]b`gh]a`a`i`b`[`gUi`Z`Y`YbXYf`Ga`c`ch`Y`
k`U`fgW`Y]b`]W`g`Y`f`k`Yb][`X`Uni`VY]hfU[`Ybž`X]Y`hUhgÄW`]W`Y`
5b[`gh`ni`j`Yff]b[`Yfb`"

K`YfZYb`k`j]f`Y]bYb`6`]W`_Ui`Zj`YfgW`]YXYbY`5fhYb`j`cb`
@YVYbga`]hhY`b`i`bX`9gg[`Yk`c`b`b`Y]hYb`i`bX`XYfYb`5i`gk`j]f`_i`b`[`Yb`
Ui`Z`Gh]a`a`i`b`[`i`bX`GhfYgg`"

7ca Zcfh: ccXg

9]gž`?`Ufhc`ZY`W`]dgž`A`UWb`W`YYgYž`[`YVfUhYbYg`<Ø`bW`Yb`i`X]YgY`
@YVYbga`]hhY`V]YhYb`c`Zha`U`g`?`ca`Zcfh]b`ghfYgg][`Yb`c`XYf`
Äb[`gh]W`Yb`A`ca`Yb`hYb`"5VYf`j`YfVYggYfb`X]YgY`@YVYbga`]hhY`
hUhgÄW`]W`X]Y`Gh]a`a`i`b`[`3`:`c`fgW`i`b`[`U`h]b`hYfYggUb`hY`
Ni`gUa`a`Yb`Äb[`Y`nk`]gW`Yb`XYf`5fh`XYf`B`U`fi`b`[`gZY`hhUi`Zb`U`a`Yž`
XYa`:`]hbYgg`Yj`Y`ž`XYa`6`c`Xmi`A`Ugg`b`XYI`f`b`A`≠`i`bX`XYf`5b[`gh`

[YnY][h"A YbgWYbž'X]Y'a Y\ f[Ygi bXY': YhY' _cbgi a]YfYb'i bX
a Y\ f'Gdcfh'hfY]VYbž'bY][Yb'XUni ž'k Yb][Yf'5b[gh'ni '\UVYb"
K Y]hYf']gh'6A =d c g]h]j 'Uggc n]]Yfh'a]h'5b[ghž'k Ug'VYXYi hYhž'XUgg
gWk YfYfY'DYfgcbYb'hmd]gWYfk Y]gY' [f0» YfY'A Yb[Yb'Ub'5b[gh
nY][Yb"

8U\Yf'_c ffY`Yfh'XYf'J YfnY\ f'j cb'@YVYbga]hY`b'a]h'\c\Ya
; Y\U'h'Ub'i b[Ygi bXYb'fYbhn0bXi b[gZ0fXYfbXYbŁ: YhYb'i bX'#
cXYf'_U'cf]Yb fY]WYb'@YVYbga]hY`bž'X]Y'ni 'Y]bYf
; Yk]W'hgni bU\ a Y'Z0\ fYbž'a]h'5b[ghni ghÀbXYb" 'I a [Y_Y\fh]gh
XUg'9ggYb' [Ygi bXYf': YhY' i bX'fY[Y'a À»][Yg'HfU]b]b['a]h'Y]bYf
j YfVYggYfhYb'Gh]a a i b['i bX'6Y'UghVuf_Y]h'j YfVi bXYb"

Hcf. '6YZc` [Yb'G]Y'X]Y', \$#&\$!F Y[Y'" '9ggYb'G]Y', \$i 'XYf'NY]h
[Ygi bXY'@YVYbga]hY`f]bgVYgcbXYfY' [Ygi bXY': YhYŁ'i bX
[0bbYb'G]Y'g]W' b]W'h'a Y\ f'U'g'&\$i 'XYf'NY]h'k Yb][Yf' [Ygi bXY
; Yf]W'hY'"@UggYb'G]Y'U`Y' ?ca Zcfh '!BU\fi b[ga]hY`k]Y
8YggYfhgž'ž b_': ccXž'Zf]h]YfhY'@YVYbga]hY`i bX'5`_c\c`Ui Z&\$i
ZU`Yb"

6fU]b': ccXg

K À\fybX'Ca Y[U!' !: YhYž'J]hUa]b'8ž?'U`n]i a ž'N]b_ž'A U[bYg]i a
i bX'DfcV]ch]_U[Yk YgYb'g]bX'XUa]h'j YfVi bXYbYb'6Y]'VYggYfYf
Gh]a a i b['i bX' [Yf]b[YfYf'5b[gh']gh'Yg'i bfYU`]gh]gW'ni 'Yfk UfhYbž
XUgg'Y]b'VYgh]a a hYg'@YVYbga]hY`cXYf'Y]bY'VYgh]a a hY
@YVYbga]hY` [fi ddY'K i bXYf'k]f_h"@YVYbga]hY`a]h'\c\Ya
BÀ\fghcZZ[Y\U'h'_0bbYb'XYb'GYfchcb]bgd]Y[Y`X]fY_h'Yf\0\Yb
cXYf'X]Y'DfcXi _h]cb'j cb'GYfchcb]b'i bhYfgh0hnYbž'Y]bYf
7\Ya]_U'Yž'X]Y'ni a 'K c\`VYZ]bXYb'i bX'; `0W`VY]hfÀ[h'i bX'X]Y
GW`UZe i U']hÀh'j YfVYggYfh"

Hcf. 'J YfVfUi WYb'G]Y'fY[Y'a À»]['@YVYbga]hY`ž'X]Y'fY]W'Ub
Ca Y[U!' !: YhYb'i bX'J]hUa]b'8'g]bXž'i bX'X]Y'UbXYfYb'k]W'h][Yb
A]_fcbÀ\fghcZZY'ZU`Yb'Ub']\fyb'D'Uhn'"9ggYb'G]Y'a]bXYghYbg'nk Y]
Dcfh]cbYb':]gW'dfc'K cWY'cXYf'bY\ a Yb'G]Y'Y]bY'\cWk Yfh][Y
:]gW'0`Yf[Àbni b['fMYgd fYWYb'G]Y'U`Y'9f[Àbni b[Yb'a]h'Y]bYa
fY[]ghf]YfhYb'9fbÀ\fi b[gVYfUHYfŁ" J YfVfUi WYb'G]Y'Ui W

@YVYbga]hhY`a]h`c\Ya `J]hUa]b`8!; Y\U`h`fl]gWk`9][Y`Vž
A]`WdfcXi _hY`i bX`D]`nYŁ`i bX`gYhmYb`G]Y`g]Wk`hÅ[`]Wk`a]bXYghYbg
%\$`A]bi hYb`XYf`GcbbY`Ui`g"

; i h: ccXg

8 Ug`8 Ufa`a]_fcV]ca`i bX`X]Y`ni [Y\Ŏf][Y`8 Ufa`!; Y\]fb!5Wk`gY
_ŎbbYb`gd]Y`Yb`Y]bY`[fc»Y`F c`Y`VY]`XYf`9bhk]W`i b[]`j`cb
5b[ghni`ghÅbXYb`i bX`8YdfYgg]cbYb`"8 Ug`8 Ufa`a]_fcV]ca`i`VYghY\h
Ui`g]a`8 Ufa`i`YVYbXYb`6U`hYf]YbžJ]fYb`i bX`D]`nYb`i bX`k`i`fXY
a]h`9bhnŎbXi`b[Ybž`<`i`b[Yf`i`bX`GÅhh][`i`b[ž
6`i`hni`W`YffY[`i`]Yfi`b[ž`5`Yf[]Ybž`dgmWk]gWk`Yf;`Ygi`bX\Y]hi`bX
UbXYfYb`Ghc`Zk`YWk`gY`Yf`_fUb`_i`b[Yb`]b`J`YfV]bXi`b[]`[YVfUWk`h`
9]bY`9bhnŎbXi`b[`cXYf`Y]bY`gWk`YWk`hY`8 Ufa`[Ygi`bX\Y]h`k`]fX`U`g
8 mgV]cgY`VYnY]Wk`bYh`j`Yf`_bŎd`Zh`ni`a`Y\fyfYb`dgmWk]gWk`Yb
9f`_fUb`_i`b[Yb`Y]b`gWk`Y]»`]Wk`5b[ghni`ghÅbXYb`i bX`8YdfYgg]cbYb`
@YVYbga]hhY`ž`X]Y`_Ŏbgh]Wk`Y`:`UfVghc`ZYž`5fca`Yb`i`bX`GŎ»`ghc`ZY
gck`]Y`Y]bYb`A`Ub[Y`Ub`6U`Ughghc`ZYb`Yb`h\U`hYbž`hfU[Yb`ni`f
8 Ufa`XmgV]cgY`VY]"`B`UhŎf`]Wk`Yž`VU`Ughghc`ZZfY]Wk`Y`J`c`k`Yfh`_c`gh
_Ubb`X]Y`8 Ufa`[Ygi`bX\Y]h`j`YfVYggYfb`"i`bhYfgi`Wk`i`b[Yb`Y[Yb
bU\Yž`XUgg`XUg`A]_fcV]ca`i`a`gc`j`]Y`ZÅ`h][Yf`i`bX
UbdUggi`b[gZÅ\][Yf`]ghž`Y`j`]Y`ZÅ`h][Yf`X]Y`9fbÅ\fi`b[]`gh"

DfcV]ch]_U`_ŎbbYb`Ui`Wk`ni`f`K`]YXYf\YfghY`i`b[`XYf
8 Ufa`a]_fcV]ca`Zi`b`_h]cb`VY]hfU[Yb`i`bX`\UVYb`XU\Yf`Y]bY`
a`Ŏ[`]Wk`Y`F c`Y`VY]`XYf`6Y\UbX`i`b[`i`bX`J`cfVYi`[`i`b[]`j`cb
5b[ghni`ghÅbXYb`"9]b`_Ŏfn`]Wk`Ghi`X]Y`_Ua`Yb`ni`XYa`GWk`i`ggž
XUgg`DfcV]ch]_Už`X]Y`a`]h`j`cb`Y`fnhYb`j`YfgWk`f]YVYbYb
A`YX]_Ua`Yb`hYb`Y]b[Ybca`a`Yb`k`i`fXYbž`X]Y`5b[ghgma`dhca`Y
k`]f`_gUa`Yf`]bXYfb`U`g`A`YX]_Ua`Yb`hY`U`Y]b`"K`Y]hYfY
I`bhYfgi`Wk`i`b[Yb`g]bX`YfZcfXYf`]Wk`ž`VYj`cf`XYf`GWk`i`gg[Ync[Yb
k`YfXYb`_Ubbž`XUgg`YXYf`fc`XYf`YXYf`a`]h`5b[ghni`ghÅbXYb`Ł
dfcV]ch]gWk`Y`9f[Åbni`b[ga`]hhY`Y]b`bY\`a`Yb`gc`hY`"9g]gh`YXcWk
g]bbj`c`ž`fY[Y`a`Å»][`@YVYbga]hhY`ni`g]Wk`ni`bY\`a`Ybž`X]Y
bUhŎf`]Wk`Y`DfcV]ch]_U`Yb`h\U`hYbž`k`]Y`œ[\i`fhž`?YZfž`HYa`dY\ž
?ca`Vi`Wk`Už`A`]gcž`?`]a`Wk`]i`bX`GUi`Yf`_fUi`h"

Hcf.`9ggYb`G]Y`Y]bY`UVk`YWk`g`i`b[gfY]Wk`Y`9fbÅ\fi`b[ž`X]Y

fY[Y`a Å»][`ZYfa Ybh]YfhY`@YVYbga]hhY`Ybh\Å`h" J Yfa Y]XYb`G]Y
_Øbgh]WXY` : UfV!ž; YgWka UW_g!`i bX`GØ» ghc ZY"

J c fVYfY]hi b [`XYg`9ggYbg

6Y]a`9ggYb` [Y\hYg` [YbUi gc` J YfV]bXi b [`k]Y`Yg`i a`9fbÅ\fi b [
 [Y\h"5a Yf]_UbYf`j YfVfUi WYb`ZUgh`X]Y`<Å`ZhY`]\fYf`A U\`nY]hYb
U`Y]b`i bX`i b [YZÅ\f`X]Y`<Å`ZhY`Ui » Yf\U`V`XYg`<Ui gYg"8]Yg`ZØ\fh
ni`Y]bYf`gY\f` [Yf]b [Yb` , VYfgWkbY]Xi b [`j cb`A U\`nY]hYbž`X]Y`a]h
: fYi bXYb`i bX`XYf` : Ua]]Y`ni`<Ui gY` [Y [YggYb`k YfXYb" ? cWYb
i bX`9ggYb`a]h]UbXYfYbž`XYfYb` ; YgY`gWUZh`G]Y` [Yb]Y» Ybž`V]YhYh
Y]bY` [Ya Y]bgUa Y` ; fi bX`U [Y`ZØf`dcg]hj Yž`VYfY]WYfbXY
8]g_i gg]cbYbž`X]Y`Ub`g]W`X]Y`Gh]a a i b [`j YfVYggYfb`i bX
5b [ghni ghÅbXY`]bXYfb`_ØbbYb"

Hcf. `6Ya Ø\Yb`G]Y`g]W`ž`ni gÅhn`]WXY`6YXYi hi b [`i bX`Nk YW`_a]h
A U\`nY]hYb`ni`Z]bXYb"9ggYb`G]Y`k Yb][Yf`U`g`XfY]`A U\`nY]hYb`dfc
K cWY"

? c b nYb hf]YfYb`G]Y`g]W`Ui Z`⇒ f`9ggYb

, VYf`Y [Yb`G]Yž`k]Y`j]Y`Y`A YbgWYb`g]W`]a`@Ui ZY`XYg`HU [Yg
VYY]`Yb`i bX`A i`h]hUg_]b [`VYhfY]VYb"8]Yg`gW`]Y» h`9ggYbgnY]hYb
Y]bž`]b`XYbYb`YXYf`gWY]bVUf`ZYfbg]Y\hž`9!A U]`g`UVfi Zh`cXYf
GcW]U`!A YX]U!GhfYUa`g`ØVYfZ]Y [h`N]Y\Yb`G]Y`XYb`BYhngHYW`Yfž`i a
⇒fY`J YfV]bXi b [`ni a`9ggYb`ni`j YfVYggYfb`i bX`X]Y`Gh]a a i b [`ni
j YfVYggYfb" GdfYWYb`G]Y`a]h: Ua]]Yba]h [`]YXYfb`ØVYf`XYb`HU [
 `hY]`Yb`G]Y`a]hž`k Ug`G]Y` [Y`Yfbh`\UVYbž`A ca YbhY`XYf
8Ub`_VUf`_Y]hi bX`ZfYi bX`]WY` ; YghYbž`X]Y`G]Y` [Y [YVYb`cXYf
Yf\U`hYb`\UVYb"

Hcf. `GYhYb`G]Y`g]W`ZØf`a`]bXYghYbg`Y]bY`A U\`nY]h`dfc`HU [`Ub
Y]bYb`9ggh]gW`i bX`n]Y\Yb`G]Y`XYb`GhYW`Yf`Ui g`XYf`GhYW`XcgY
fb]h`5i gbU\`a Y`XYf`<]bhYf [fi bXa i g]_ž`ZU`g` [Yk ØbgW`h`
? c b nYb hf]YfYb`G]Y`g]W`bi f`Ui ZXUg`9ggYb`i bX`XUg`J YfV]bXYb`a]h
UbXYfYb`k Å\fybX`XYf`A U\`nY]hYb"

9g`_Ubb`]a`A ca Ybh`gW`k]Yf] [`gY]bž`g]W`XUfUb`ni`Yf]bbYfbž`UVYf

_cbg]ghYbhY'i bX`Ub[Zf]gh]['[Ygi bXY`9gg[Yk c\b\Y]hYb
fYXi n]YfYb`X]Y`5b[gh'a Y\f`U`g`YXYg`Y]bnY`bY`@YVYbga]hhY`ž
; YhfÀb_cXYf`B U\fi b[gYf[Àbni b[ga]hhY`"8 UfØVYf`\]bUi g`ZØfXYfh
X]Y`J YfV]bXi b['a]h`@YVYbga]hhY`b`i bX`UbXYfYb`A YbgWXYb`Y]bY
dcg]hj Y`6Yn]Y\i b[`ni`9ggYb`i bX`9ggYbgnY]hYb"i a`Y]bY
cdh]a U`Y`dgmW]gWXY; Ygi bX\Y]hni`Yfn]Y`Ybžgc`hYb`G]Y`XU\Yf
XYb`J YfnY\f`[Ygi bXYfžj]Y`ZÀ`h][Yf`@YVYbga]hhY`df]cf]g]YfYb`i bX
g]W`a]h`@YVYbga]hhY`b`i bX`UbXYfYb`i]b`J YfV]bXi b[`gYhnYb"

.."

gd]f]Yfhj cb`579

8YhU]`g

6Ygi WXYb`G]Y`i bg`Ui Z.`a`Y]b!Z]hbYgg"bYh