

K]Y`a Ub`@YVYbga]hhY`j Yfk YbXYhž`i a
5b[gh`ni ``]bXYfb

: Øf`j]Y`Y`A YbgWXYb`]gh`XYf`GhfYgg`Ui Z`Y]bYa `5``nY]h\cW`"
C V k c`\'k]f`X]Y`GhfYggei Y``Yb`b]W`h`j c``gh`AbX][`Ui g`i bgYfYa
@YVYb`YbhZYfbYb`_ÖbbYbž`_ÖbbYb`k]f`K Yf_nYi [Y`i bX
HYW`b]_Yb`Z]bXYbž`X]Y`i bg`\'Y`ZYbž`XYb`GhfYgg`VYggYf`ni
VYk `Ä`h][Yb``8]Y`J YfVYggYfi b[`XYf`GW`UZ[Yk c`b`\'Y]hYbž`X]Y
GhY][Yfi b[`XYf`_ÖfdYf`WXYb`5_h]j]h`Ähž`XUg`, VYb`j cb
5W`hgUa _Y]hi bX`XUg`HfYbbYb`j cb`B U W`f]W`hYb`cXYf
gc n]U`Yb`A YX]Yb`_ÖbbYb`XYZ]b]h]j `Y]bYb`[fc»Yb`6Y]hfU[`ni f
F YXi n]Yfi b[`j cb`GhfYgg`Y]ghYb``i bX`k]Y`X]YgYf`5fh]_Y`
Yf`_Äfhž`_Ubb`X]Y`YbXYfi b[`ÄfYf`9gg[Yk c`b`\'Y]hYb`Ui W`
Y]bYb`[fc»Yb`6Y]hfU[`ni f`6Yk `Ä`h][i b[`ÄfYg`GhfYgg b]j YUi g
`Y]ghYb``Ni b`ÄW`gh`a i gg`ZYgh[YghY``h`k YfXYbž`XUgg`_Y]bY
@YVYbga]hhY`5b[gh`j Yfi fgUWXYb`cXYf`j Yf\]bXYfb``8]Y
: cfgW`i b[`_Ubb`i bg`ja / Ua d`^Y``]d/



: Øf`j]Y`Y`A YbgWXYb`]gh`XYf`GhfYgg`Ui Z`Y]bYa `5``nY]h\cW`" C V k c`\
k]f`X]Y`GhfYggei Y``Yb`b]W`h`j c``gh`AbX][`Ui g`i bgYfYa `@YVYb
YbhZYfbYb`_ÖbbYbž`_ÖbbYb`k]f`K Yf_nYi [Y`i bX`HYW`b]_Yb`Z]bXYbž
X]Y`i bg`\'Y`ZYbž`XYb`GhfYgg`VYggYf`ni `VYk `Ä`h][Yb``8]Y
J YfVYggYfi b[`XYf`GW`UZ[Yk c`b`\'Y]hYbž`X]Y`GhY][Yfi b[`XYf`

_ÖfdYf`jWXYb`5_hj] jhÄhž`XUg` , VYb`j cb`5WÄhgUa _Y]hi` bX`XUg
HfYbbYb`j cb`B UWÄfjWÄhYb`cXYf`gcn]U`Yb`A YX]Yb`_ÖbbYb`XYZb]hj
Y]bYb`[fc»Yb`6Y]hfU[`ni f`FYXi n]Yfi b[`j cb`GhfYgg`Y]ghYb`"i bX
k]Y`X]YgYf`5fh]_Y`Yf`_Äfhž`_Ubb`X]Y`YbXYfi b[`ÄfYf
9gg[Yk c`b`Y]hYb`Ui WÄ`Y]bYb`[fc»Yb`6Y]hfU[`ni f`6Yk Ä`h][i b[
ÄfYg`GhfYggb]j YUi g`Y]ghYb`"

Ni bÄWÄgh`a i gg`ZYgh[YghY`h`k YfXYbž`XUgg`_Y]bY`@VYbga]hhY`
5b[gh] Yfi fgUWÄYb`cXYf`j Yf`bXYfb`"8]Y` : cfgWÄi b[`_Ubb`i bg`ja
5`[Ya Y]bYb`a Y`f`XUfØVYf`YfnÄ`Yb`J YfVÄbXY Y`Yf`U`g
I fgUWÄYb`/A]h`UbXYfYb`K cfhYbž`Yg`_Ubb`i bg`gU[Ybž`XUgg`XUg
9ggYb`cXYf`J Yfa Y]XYb`VYgh]a a hYf`@VYbga]hhY`a Y`f`cXYf
k Yb][Yf`a]h`5b[gh] YfVi bXYb`gY]b`_Ubb`"

8UfØVYf`\]bUi g`k]f`Yb`g]WÄ`X]Y`@VYbga]hhY`ž`X]Y`G]Y`fY[Y`a Ä»][
_cbgi a]YfYbž`Y`Yf`Ui Z`XUg`5b[ghb]j YUi `Ui g`U`g`YXY`Y]bnY`bY
A U`nY]h`"?cbg]ghYbhYž`dcg]hj Y`9fbÄ`fi b[g[Yk c`b`Y]hYb`k]Y`X]Y
6Y[fYbni b[`j cb`ž`b`! : ccXž`XYf`?cbgi a `j cb`Ui gfY]WÄYbX
J]hUa]b`8`i bX`Ca Y[U!`!fY]WÄYb`@VYbga]hhY`bž`Y]bY
UVk YWÄg`i b[gfY]WÄY`9fbÄ`fi b[ž`XUg`?cWÄYb`Y][YbYf
@VYbga]hhY`i bX`XUg` , VYb`j cb`5WÄhgUa _Y]h`VY]a `9ggYb`_ÖbbYb
XUg`5b[ghb]j YUi `i bX`X]Y`U`[Ya Y]bY`Gh]a a i b[`Yf`YV`]WÄ
j YfVYggYfb`"8U`Yf`k]fX`Y]b` gh]a a i b[gUi Z`Y`YbXYf`Ga cch`Y
k U`fgWÄY]b`]WÄ`gY`f`k Yb][`XUni `VY]hfU[Ybž`X]Y`hUhgÄWÄ`]WÄY
5b[gh`ni `j Yff]b[Yfb`"

K YfZYb`k]f`Y]bYb`6`]W`_Ui Zj YfgWÄ]YXYbY`5fhYb`j cb
@VYbga]hhY`b`i bX`9gg[Yk c`b`Y]hYb`i bX`XYfYb`5i gk]f`_i b[Yb
Ui Z`Gh]a a i b[`i bX`GhfYgg`"

7ca Zcfh` : ccXg

9]gž`? UfhcZZY`WÄ]dgž`A UWb WÄYYgYž[YVfUhYbYg`<Ø`bWÄYb` `X]YgY
@VYbga]hhY`V]YhYb`cZha U`g`?ca Zcfh]b`ghfYgg][Yb`cXYf
Äb[gh]WÄYb`A ca YbhYb`"5VYf`j YfVYggYfb`X]YgY`@VYbga]hhY`
hUhgÄWÄ`]WÄ`X]Y`Gh]a a i b[3` : cfgWÄi b[`Uhi]bhYfYggUbhY
Ni gUa a Yb`Äb[Y`nk]gWÄYb`XYf`5fh`XYf`B U`fi b[gZYhhUi ZbU`a Yž
XYa ` :]hbYgg`Yj Y`ž`XYa `6cXmiA Ugg`ÆXYI`fßA Æ`i bX`XYf`5b[gh

[YnY][h"A YbgWYbž'X]Y'a Y\ f[Ygi bXY': YhY' _cbgi a]YfYb'i bX
a Y\ f'Gdcfh'hfY]VYbž'bY][Yb'XUni ž'k Yb][Yf'5b[gh'ni '\UVYb"
K Y]hYf'gh'6A =**dcgjhj 'Uggcnj]Yfh'a**]h'5b[ghž'k Ug'VYXYi hYhž'XUgg
gWk YfYfY'DYfgcbYb'hmd]gWYfk Y]gY' [fO» YfY'A Yb[Yb'Ub'5b[gh
nY][Yb"

8U\Yf'_cffY`Yfh'XYf'J YfnY\ f'j cb'@VYbga]hY`b'a]h'\c\Ya
; Y\U'h'Ub'i b[Ygi bXYb'fYbhnØbXi b[gZOfXYfbXYbŁ': YhYb'i bX'#
cXYf'_U'cf]Yb fY]WYb'@VYbga]hY`bž'X]Y'ni 'Y]bYf
; Yk]W'hgni bU\ a Y'ZØ\ fYbž'a]h'5b[ghni ghÅbXYb" 'I a [Y_Y\fh]gh
XUg'9ggYb' [Ygi bXYf': YhY' i bX'fY[Y'a Å»][Yg'HfU]b]b['a]h'Y]bYf
j YfVYggYfhYb'Gh]a a i b['i bX'6Y`UghVUf_Y]h'j YfVi bXYb"

Hcf. '6YZc`[Yb'G]Y'X]Y', \$#&\$!F Y[Y'" '9ggYb'G]Y', \$i 'XYf'NY]h
[Ygi bXY'@VYbga]hY`f]bgVYgcbXYfY' [Ygi bXY': YhYŁ'i bX
[ØbbYb'G]Y'g]W' b]W'h'a Y\ f'U'g'&\$i 'XYf'NY]h'k Yb][Yf' [Ygi bXY
; Yf]W'hY'"@UggYb'G]Y'U`Y' ?ca Zcfh '!BU\fi b[ga]hY`k]Y
8YggYfhgž'ž b_': ccXž'Zf]hh]YfhY'@VYbga]hY`i bX'5`_c\c`Ui Z&\$i
ZU`Yb"

6fU]b': ccXg

K Å\ fYbX'C a Y[U!' !: YhYž'J]hUa]b'8ž'?U`n]i a ž'N]b_ž'A U[bYg]i a
i bX'DfcV]ch]_U[Yk YgYb'g]bX'**XUa]h'j YfVi bXYbYb'6Y]**VYggYfYf
Gh]a a i b['i bX' [Yf]b[YfYf'5b[gh']gh'Yg'i bfYU`]gh]gW'ni 'Yfk UfhYbž
XUgg'Y]b'VYgh]a a hYg'@VYbga]hY`cXYf'Y]bY'VYgh]a a hY
@VYbga]hY`[fi ddY'K i bXYf'k]f_h"@VYbga]hY`a]h'\c\Ya
BÅ\fghcZZ[Y\U'h'_ØbbYb'XYb'GYfchcb]bgd]Y[Y`X]fY_h'Yf\Ø\Yb
cXYf'X]Y'DfcXi _h]cb'j cb'GYfchcb]b'i bhYfghØhnYbž'Y]bYf
7\Ya]_U`Yž'X]Y'ni a 'K c\`VYZ]bXYb'i bX'; `ØW`VY]hfÅ[h'i bX'X]Y
GW`UZe i U]hÅh'j YfVYggYfh"

Hcf. 'J YfVfUi WYb'G]Y'fY[Y'a Å»]['@VYbga]hY`ž'X]Y'fY]W'Ub
Ca Y[U!' !: YhYb'i bX'J]hUa]b'8'g]bXž'i bX'X]Y'UbXYfYb'k]W'h][Yb
A]_fcbÅ\fghcZZY'ZU`Yb'Ub']\fYb'D`Uhn"'9ggYb'G]Y'a]bXYghYbg'nk Y]
Dcfh]cbYb':]gW'dfc'K cWY'cXYf'bY\ a Yb'G]Y'Y]bY'\cWk Yfh][Y
:]gW'Ø`Yf[Åbni b['fMYgd fYWYb'G]Y'U`Y'9f[Åbni b[Yb'a]h'Y]bYa
fY[]ghf]YfhYb'9fbÅ\fi b[gVYfUHYfŁ'"J YfVfUi WYb'G]Y'Ui W

@YVYbga]hhY`a]h`c\Ya`J]hUa]b`8!; Y\U`h`fl]gWxž`9][Y`Vž
A]`Wx`dfcXi`_hY`i bX`D]`nYŁ`i bX`gYhnYb`G]Y`g]Wx`hÅ[`]Wx`a]bXYghYbg
%\$`A]bi hYb`XYf`GcbbY`Ui`g"

; i h` : ccXg

8 Ug`8 Ufa`a]_fcV]ca`i bX`X]Y`ni [Y\Ŏf][Y`8 Ufa`!; Y\]fb!5WxgY
_ŎbbYb`gd]Y`Yb`Y]bY`[fc»Y`F c`Y`VY]`XYf`9bhk]W`i b[]`j cb
5b[ghni ghÅbXYb`i bX`8YdfYgg]cbYb`"8 Ug`8 Ufa`a]_fcV]ca`i`VYghY\h
Ui`g]a`i`8 Ufa`i`VYVbXYb`6U`_hYf]Ybž`J]fYb`i bX`D]`nYb`i bX`k`i`fXY
a]h`9bhnŎbXi`b[Ybž`<`i b[Yf`i bX`GÅhh][i b[ž
6`i`hni W`YffY[i`i`Yfi b[ž`5`Yf[]Ybž`dgmWx]gWxYf`; Ygi bX\Y]h`i bX
UbXYfYb`Ghc`Zk`YWxgY`Yf`_fUb`_i b[Yb`]b`J`YfV]bXi`b[]`[YVfUWx`h"
9]bY`9bhnŎbXi`b[]`cXYf`Y]bY`gWx`YWx`hY`8 Ufa`[Ygi bX\Y]h`k`]fX`U`g
8mgV]cgY`VYnY]Wx`bYh`j Yf`_bŎdZh`ni`a`Y\fyfYb`dgmWx]gWxYb
9f`_fUb`_i b[Yb`Y]bgWx`Y]»`]Wx`5b[ghni ghÅbXYb`i bX`8YdfYgg]cbYb`"
@YVYbga]hhY`ž`X]Y`_Ŏbgh]Wx`Y`UfVghc`ZYž`5fca`Yb`i bX`GŎ»ghc`ZY
gck]Y`Y]bYb`A`Ub[Y`Ub`6U`Ughghc`ZYb`Yb`h\U`hYbž`hfU[Yb`ni`f
8 Ufa`XmgV]cgY`VY]"`B`UhŎf`]Wx`Yž`VU`Ughghc`ZZfY]Wx`Y`J`c`k`Yfh`_cgh
_Ubb`X]Y`8 Ufa`[Ygi bX\Y]h`j`YfVYggYfb`"i`bhYfgi`Wxi`b[Yb`Y`Y[Yb
bU\Yž`XUgg`XUg`A]_fcV]ca`i`a`gc`j]Y`ZÅ`h][Yf`i bX
UbdUggi`b[gZÅ\][Yf`]ghž`Y`j]Y`ZÅ`h][Yf`X]Y`9fbÅ\fi`b[]`gh"

DfcV]ch]_U`_ŎbbYb`Ui`Wx`ni`f`K`]YXYf\YfghY`i b[]`XYf
8 Ufa`a]_fcV]ca`Z`b`_h]cb`VY]hfU[Yb`i bX`\UVYb`XU\Yf`Y]bY`
a`Ŏ[`]Wx`Y`F c`Y`VY]`XYf`6Y\UbX`i b[]`i bX`J`cfVYi [i b[]`j cb
5b[ghni ghÅbXYb`"9]b`_Ŏfn`]Wx`Ghi`X]Y`_Ua`Yb`ni`XYa`i`GWx`i`ggž
XUgg`DfcV]ch]_Už`X]Y`a`]h`j`cb`Y`fnhYb`j`YfgWx`f]YVYbYb
A`YX]_Ua`Yb`hYb`Y]b[Yb`ca`a`Yb`k`i`fXYbž`X]Y`5b[ghgma`dhca`Y
k`]f`_gUa`Yf`i]bXYfb`U`g`A`YX]_Ua`Yb`hY`U`Y]b`"K`Y]hYfY
i`bhYfgi`Wxi`b[Yb`g]bX`YfZcfXYf`]Wx`ž`VYj`cf`XYf`GWx`i`gg[Ync[Yb
k`YfXYb`_Ubbž`XUgg`Y`XYf`fc`XYf`Y`XYf`a`]h`5b[ghni ghÅbXYbŁ
dfcV]ch]gWx`Y`9f[Åbni`b[ga`]hhY`Y]bbY\`a`Yb`gc`hY`"9g]gh`Y`XcWx
g]bbj`c`ž`fY[Y`a`Å»][]`@YVYbga]hhY`ni`g]Wx`ni`bY\`a`Ybž`X]Y
bUhŎf`]Wx`Y`DfcV]ch]_U`Yb`h\U`hYbž`k`]Y`ŕ[\i`fhž`?YZfž`HYa`dY\ž
?ca`Vi`Wx`Už`A`]gcž`?`]a`Wx`]i bX`GUi`Yf`_fUi`h"

Hcf.`9ggYb`G]Y`Y]bY`UVk`YWxg`i b[gfY]Wx`Y`9fbÅ\fi`b[ž`X]Y

fY[Y`a Å»][`ZYfa Ybh]YfhY`@YVYbga`jhY`Ybh\Å`h"J Yfa Y]XYb`G]Y
_Øbgh`]WXY`UfV!ž; YgW\ a UW_g!`i bX`GØ»ghc ZY"

J c fVYfY]hi b[`XYg`9ggYbg

6Y]a`9ggYb`[Y\hYg`[YbUi gc`J YfV]bXi b[`k]Y`Yg`i a`9fbÅ\fi b[
[Y\h"5a Yf]_UbYf`j YfVfUi WYb`ZUgh`X]Y`<Å`ZhY`]\fYf`A U\`nY]hYb
U`Y]b`i bX`i b[YZÅ\f`X]Y`<Å`ZhY`Ui »Yf\U`V`XYg`<Ui gYg"8]Yg`ZØ\fh
ni`Y]bYf`gY\f`[Yf]b[Yb`, VYfgW\ bY]Xi b[`j cb`A U\`nY]hYbž`X]Y`a`jh
: fYi bXYb`i bX`XYf`Ua`]Y`ni`<Ui gY`[Y[YggYb`k YfXYb"?cWYb
i bX`9ggYb`a`h]UbXYfYbž`XYfYb`; YgY`gW\UZh`G]Y`[Yb]Y»Ybž`V]YhYh
Y]bY`[Ya Y]bgUa Y`; fi bX`U[Y`ZØf`dcg]hj Yž`VYfY]WYfbXY
8]g_i gg]cbYbž`X]Y`Ub`g]W\`X]Y`Gh]a`a i b[`j YfVYggYfb`i bX
5b[ghni ghÅbXY`]bXYfb`_ØbbYb"

Hcf.`6Ya Ø\Yb`G]Y`g]W\ž`ni gÅhn`]WXY`6YXYi hi b[`i bX`Nk YW_`a`jh
A U\`nY]hYb`ni`Z]bXYb""9ggYb`G]Y`k Yb][Yf`U`g`XfY]`A U\`nY]hYb`dfc
K cWXY"

? c b nYb hf]YfYb`G]Y`g]W\`Ui Z`≡f`9ggYb

„ VYf`Y[Yb`G]Yž`k]Y`j]Y`Y`A YbgW\Yb`g]W\`]a`@Ui ZY`XYg`HU[Yg
VYY]`Yb`i bX`A`i`h]hUg_]b[`VYhfY]VYb""8]Yg`gW\`]Y»h`9ggYbgnY]hYb
Y]bž`]b`XYbYb`Y`XYf`gW\Y]bVUf`ZYfbg]Y\hž`9!A U]`g`UVfi Zh`cXYf
GcW]U`!A YX]U]GhfYUa`g`ØVYfZ]Y[h`N]Y\Yb`G]Y`XYb`BYhngYhW_Yfž`i a
≡fY`J YfV]bXi b[`ni a`9ggYb`ni`j YfVYggYfb`i bX`X]Y`Gh]a`a i b[`ni
j YfVYggYfb""GdfYW\Yb`G]Y`a`]h: Ua`]Yba`jh[`]YXYfb`ØVYf`XYb`HU[
`hY]`Yb`G]Y`a`]hž`k Ug`G]Y`[Y`Yfbh`\UVYbž`A ca YbhY`XYf
8Ub_VUf_Y]hi bX`ZfYi bX`]WXY`; YghYbž`X]Y`G]Y`[Y[YVYb`cXYf
Yf\U`hYb`\UVYb"

Hcf.`GYhYb`G]Y`g]W\`ZØf`a`]bXYghYbg`Y]bY`A U\`nY]h`dfc`HU[`Ub
Y]bYb`9ggh]gW\`i bX`n]Y\Yb`G]Y`XYb`GhYhW_Yf`Ui g`XYf`GhYhW_XcgY
fb`]h`5i gbU\ a Y`XYf`<]bhYf[fi bXa`i g]_ž`ZU`g`[Yk ØbgW\hŁ"
?c b nYb hf]YfYb`G]Y`g]W\`bi f`Ui ZXUg`9ggYb`i bX`XUg`J YfV]bXYb`a`]h
UbXYfYb`k Å\fybX`XYf`A U\`nY]hYb"

9g`_Ubb`]a`A ca Ybh`gW\k]Yf][`gY]bž`g]W\`XUfUb`ni`Yf]bbYfbž`UVYf

_cbg]ghYbhY'i bX`Ub[Zf]gh]['[Ygi bXY`9gg[Yk c\b\Y]hYb
fYXi n]YfYb`X]Y`5b[gh'a Y\f`U`g`YXYg`Y]bnY`bY`@YVYbga]hhY`ž
; YhfÀb_`cXYf`BU\fi b[gYf[Àbni b[ga]hhY`"8UfØVYf`\]bUi g`ZØfXYfh
X]Y`J YfV]bXi b[`a]h`@YVYbga]hhY`b`i bX`UbXYfYb`A YbgWXYb`Y]bY
dcg]hj Y`6Yn]Y\i b[`ni`9ggYb`i bX`9ggYbgnY]hYb`"I a`Y]bY
cdh]a U`Y`dgmW\]gWXY`; Ygi bX\Y]h`ni`Yfn]Y`Ybž`gc`hYb`G]Y`XU\Yf
XYb`J YfnY\f`[Ygi bXYfž`j]Y`ZÀ`h][Yf`@YVYbga]hhY`df]cf]g]YfYb`i bX
g]W\`a]h`@YVYbga]hhY`b`i bX`UbXYfYb`]b`J YfV]bXi b[`gYhnYb"

..

⌘gd]f]Yfh]j cb`579

8YhU]`g

6Ygi WXYb`G]Y`i bg`Ui Z.`a Y]b!Z]hbYgg"bYh