

Gc `k À\`Yb `G]Y `XYb `:]hb Ygg! ? Uff]YfYk Y[ž
XYf`ni` ``= bYb `dUggh

=W ` \UVY [YfUXY `a Y]bY `DfØZI b[`VYghUbXYb °`K Ug `Yhnh3` =W
ghc» Y `ZUgh`YYXYb `HU[`Ui Z`Dcghg`i bX `B UWf]W hYb `k]Y `X]YgY
j cb `; Ygi bX\Y]hg! `i bX `HfU]b]b[gYI dYfhYbž`X]Y
9bh`i g]Uga i gž`K]ggYb `i bX `@Y]XYbgW UZh` \UVYbž`UVYf`Y]b
k Yb][`i bg]W Yf`g]bXž`k c\]b `g]Y `] \fY ` [UbnY `9bYf[]Y `ghYW_Yb
gc ``Yb " <]Yf`]gh`Y]b `; VYfV`]W `ØVYf`Y]b][Y `GWf]hhYž`X]Y `G]Y
i b hYfbY\ a Yb ` _ÒbbYbž`i a `X]Y `6fUbW Y`ni `Yf_`i bXYb `i bX
= fYb `D`Uhn`ni `Z]bXYb. `8Y]b]YfYb `G]Y `= f`K Yfž`K Ug `i bX
K Ufi a `8Yf`[fØ`hY `: Y\`Yfž`XYb `]W `VY]`bYi Yb `DfcZ]g`gY\Y
fl bX `gc[Uf`VY]`YfZU\ fYbYb `DfcZ]gž`X]Y `bUW `] \fYf`bÀW ghYb
; Y`Y[Yb\Y]hg! W Ybž`]ghž`g]W `b]W hX]Y `NY]h`ni `bY\ a Ybž`i a
ni `Yf_`ÀfYbž`k Ug`/ Ua d\Y`]d/



=W ` \UVY [YfUXY `a Y]bY `DfØZI b[`VYghUbXYb °`K Ug `Yhnh3`
=W `ghc» Y `ZUgh`YYXYb `HU[`Ui Z`Dcghg`i bX `B UWf]W hYb `k]Y `X]YgY j cb
; Ygi bX\Y]hg! `i bX `HfU]b]b[gYI dYfhYbž`X]Y `9bh`i g]Uga i gž`K]ggYb
i bX `@Y]XYbgW UZh` \UVYbž`UVYf`Y]b `k Yb][`i bg]W Yf`g]bXž`k c\]b `g]Y
] \fY ` [UbnY `9bYf[]Y `ghYW_Yb `gc ``Yb `

<]Yf.]gh.Y]b_, VYfV]W_ØVYf.Y]b][Y.GW\ f]hhYž.X]Y.G]Y i b hYfbY\ a Yb
_ØbbYbži a X]Y.6fUbW\ Y ni Yf_i bXYb i bX ÁfYb D`Uhñ ni Z]bXYb.

8YZ]b]YfYb'G]Y Áf'K Yfž'K Ug'i bX'K Ufi a

8Yf[fØ» hY : Y\`Yfž'XYb']W\`VY]bYi Yb'DfcZ]g'gY\Y'fl bX'gc[Uf'VY]
YfZU\ fYbYb'DfcZ]gž'X]Y'bUW\']\fYf'bÀW\ghYb'; Y\Y[Yb\Y]h'gi W\Ybž
]ghž'g]W\`b]W\h'X]Y'NY]h'ni bY\ a Ybži a ni Yf_ÁfYbž'k Ug'g]Y'ni hi b
j Yfgi W\Yb i bX'k Ufi a g]Y j Yfgi W\Ybž'X]Yg'ni YffY]W\Yb"

CZh'ghY][Yb'k]f'Ui g'9][Ybbi hn']b'X]Y.6fUbW\Y'Y]b/K]f' bY\ a Yb
[YfbY'Ub ?i fgYb'hY]ž'hfU]b]YfYb'cXYf'\UVYb'Y]bY'bUhØf]W\Y'@]YVY
ZØf'U''Y'8]b[Y'fi bX'i a'; Ygi bX\Y]h'i bX'K Y''bYgg'K]f'\UVYb
[YgY\Ybž'k]Y'UbXYfY'DfcZ]g']\fY'5b[YVchY'ni gUa a YbghY''Yb.
k Yb'g]Y'VYX]YbYbž'k Ug'g]Y'']YZYfb'i bX'k c'g]Y'UfVY]hYb''CVk c\`
X]Yg'Y]b[fc»Ufh][Yf'5i g[Ub[gdi b_h']ghž'a ØggYb'G]Y'Y]b][Y'NY]h
a]h'XYf'6Ygh]a a i b[j YfVf]b[Yb'XY]b'N]Y'a Uf_h'i bX'GYfj]W\
Bi a a Yf'Y]bg'G]Y'g]bX'Ub'XYf'6YfY]hghY''i b[]bhYfYgg]Yfh"
K Á\ fYbX'g]W\`X]YgY'VY]XYb'Di b_h']a '@Ui ZY'XYf'NY]h'ÁbXYfb
_ØbbYbž'gc''hYb'G]Y'g]W\`ØVYf'U'`Uf'k YfXYb'K <C'i bX'Y]b'k Ug
_Ubb'ÁbYb'`Y'ZYbž'A Ø[`]W\`Y]hYb'ni Yf_i bXYbž'ni gÁhn']W\Yg
K]ggYb'i bX'9fZU\ fi b[ni gUa a Y'bži a X]Y'A Ø[`]W\`Y]hYb'ni
bi hnYb'i bX']b'X]YgYa'; YgW\Ázh'j cfUbni _ca a Yb"

8Y]b'k Ufi a]gh'YbhgW\Y]XYbX''5bXYfY'DfcZ]g'_ØbbYb'XUg'[`Y]W\Y
\UVYb'K <C'i bX'XUg'[`Y]W\Y'k Ugž'UVYf'XY]b'k Ufi a]gh'dYfgØb']W\g
]bbj c'''i bX'_Ubb'ÁbYb'`Y'ZYbž'g]W\ j cb'UbXYfYb': UW\`Yi hYb
UVni \YVYbž'i a XYb'`V'ni VY_ca a Yb''K Ufi a '\UVYb'G]Y'g]W\
[YfUXY'ZØf'X]YgYb'N]Y'a Uf_h'YbhgW\]YXYb3'CYf'k Ufi a '\UVYb
G]Y'g]W\`ZØf'XUg'YbhgW\]YXYb'k Ug3'8]Y'`UfY': cfa i ']Yfi b['XYf
5bh'cfh'Ui ZX]YgY'VY]XYb': fU[Yb'V]XYh'X]Y'; fi bX'U[Y'ZØf'Áf
dYfgØb']W\Yg'6fUbX]b[i bX'\`Zh'ÁbYbž'g]W\ a]h'XYb'Yb][Yb'ni
j YfV]bXYbž'XYbYb'G]Y'gck c\`Xi fw\ Áf'A Uf_Yh]b['U'g'Ui W\`Xi fw\
ÁfY'5fVY]h'X]YbYb'a ØW\hYb"

9b hXYW\Yb'G]Y'A Ø[`]W\`Y]hYb

5i g[YghUhYh'a]h'Y]bYa' _`UfYb'K Yfž'K Ug'i bX'K Ufi a '_ØbbYb'G]Y

Yhnh`Yf_i bXYbžk Ug'j YfZØ[VUf']gh" F YWYfWY]YfYb'G]Y i bX'XYb_Yb
 G]Y ØVYf'XYb'HY`YffUbX'\]bUi g'6Y[]bbYb'G]Y a]h'XYb
 cZYbg]WYh]WYb'CdjhcbYbža]h'XYbYb'G]Y'jb'XYf'JYf[Ub[Yb\Y]h
]bhYfU[]Yfh'UVYb'cXYf'Ui ZX]Y'G]Y' [Yghc» Yb'g]bX''8 Uni '_ObbYb
 I bhYff]WYhghi bXYb'jb'Y]bYa 'A Y\fnk YW_!:]hbYggWi V'cXYf
 HfU]b]b[']b'Y]bYa '9f\c'i b[gnYbhfi a '[Y\ØfYb''HUi WYb'G]Y
 Y]bZUWY'Yhk Ug'h]YZYf'Y]b' i bX'gY\Yb'G]YžcV'Yg'UbXYfY'CfhY'[]Vhž
 X]Y'Yg'k Yfh'g]bXži bhYfgi WYhni 'k YfXYb"

<]Yf'g]bX'Y]b'dUUf'6'c[gžX]Y'U_hi Y``Y'A Ø[']WY_Y]hYb
 Ui ZgWY ØggY'bžX]Y'Yg'k Yfh'g]bXžZØf'dYfgØb']WYg'HfU]b]b[
 fbfVY]hYb'ZØf'Ya UbX'UbXYfYbžYf_i bXYhni 'k YfXYb'cXYf
 GY'VghghAbX][_Y]hž; fci d':]hbYgg'i bX'; Ygi bX\Y]hgWcUWY]b["
 K Ybb'G]Y'X]YgY'; Y`Y[Yb\Y]hYb'dfØZYbžk]XYfghY\Yb'G]Y'XYa
 8fUb[žg]WY' i a ni [YghU'hYb "A]h'UbXYfYb'K cfhYbžUbghUhY]bY
 GhY``YbUi ggWYfY]Vi b['ni 'gY\Yb' i bX'ni 'gU[Yb.' C\žXUg'_ObbY
]WY'hi b'žVY[]bbYb'G]Y'a]h'ΔfYa 'K YfžK Ug' i bX'K Ufi a'ž'i a
 g]WYfni ghY``YbžXUgg'X]Y'; Y`Y[Yb\Y]h'Yg'ΔbYb'Yfa Ø[']WYhžUb
 XYf'GWYb]hhghY``Y'j cb'Nk YW_! bX'; Yk]bb'ni 'gY]b"

5i WY'k Ybb'X]Y'; Y`Y[Yb\Y]h'Y]b'k Yb]['Ui » Yf\U'V'ΔfYf
 F Y]WYk Y]hY'ni '']Y[Yb'gWYb'hžk YfZYb'G]Y'ΔfYb'B'Ua'Yb'']b'XYb
 F]b[''9fZU\ fYb'G]Y'a Y\ f'ØVYf'X]Y'YfZcfXYf']WYb'9fk Ufhi b[Yb
 i bX'9fZU\ fi b[Yb": Ø[Yb'G]Y'X]Yg'ΔfYf'Ui ZYbXYb' Hc!8c !@ghY
 \]bni žXUa]h'G]Y'a]h'XYf'D'Ubi b['VY[]bbYb'_ObbYb'Yhnh: Øf'X]Y
 K Y]hYfV]'Xi b['a ØggYb'G]Y']b'ΔfYb'[Yk A\hYb'?Uff]YfYk Y['U'g
 ; Ygi bX\Y]hg! 'i bX'HfU]b]b[gZUWY a Ubb'\]bY]bk UWYgYb"

9]b hUi WYb

5a 'VYghYb'hUi WYb'G]Y'Y]b' i bX'a UWYb'g]WY'Ub'X]Y'5fVY]h"
 GY'Vgh'k Ybb'G]Y'bcWY'_Y]bYb'xv'[YZ' bXYb'cXYf'XUg'; YgWY ÁZhž
 XUg'G]Y'[fØbXYb'a ØWYhYbžbcWY'b]WYhj c'ghAbX]['XYZ]b]Yfh
 \UVYbža ØggYb'G]Y'bcWY'Y]b][Y'GWYf]hhY' i bhYfbY\ a Ybži a'g]WY
]b'X]Y'f]WYh][Y'F]WYh' i b'ni 'VYk Y[Yb'"<]Yf'g]bX'Y]b'dUUf'8]b[Yž
 X]Y'G]Y'hi b' _ObbYbži a'ΔfYf'?Uff]YfY'GWYk i b['ni 'j Yf'Y]\ Yb.''

- FY_fi h]YfYb' i bX'dfcVYb. 'Gi WYb'G]Y'g]WY'Y]b'dUUf

: Ua]]Yba]h[`]YXYfž: fYi bXY`i bX`6Y_UbbhY`U`g
J Yfgi Wg_Ub]bWYb"]J Yfgi WYb`G]YžDYfgcbYb
Ui gni k À\`YbžX]Y`HY]`Δ fYg`N]Y`a Uf_hYg`gY]b`k ØfXYb"
, VYb`G]Y`Δ fY`?`UggYb`cXYf`G]hni b[Yb`i bX`V]hhYb`G]Y`i a
: YYXVUW_`8]Yg`\]Zh`Δ bYb`b]WWh`bi f`XUVY]ž9fZU\fi b[Yb
ni `gUa a Y`b`i bX`Δ fY`: À\][_Y]hYb`ni `j YfZY]bYfbžgc bXYfb
VYghÀh][h`Ui W`Δ f`K YfžK Ug`i bX`K Ufi a "DUggYb`G]Y`bUW
6YXUfZ`Ub"

- *@YgYb`i bX`fYW YfW JYfYb. Bi f`k Y]`Δ fY`DfØZ b[ghU[Y
\]bhYf`Δ bYb`]Y[YbžVYXYi hYh`XUg`b]WWhžXUgg`Yg`Ub`XYf
NY]h`ghžX]Y`6ØW Yf`k Y[ni `Y[Yb`Δ hnhžXU`G]Y`k]ggYbža]h
k Ya`G]Y`ni gUa a YbUfVY]hYb`a ØWWhYbžk Y`W Y
8]Ybg`Y]ghi b[Yb`G]Y`UbV]YhYb`a ØWWhYb`i bX`k Ug
YfZcfXYf`]WWh`ghž`i a `X]Y`A Ø[`]WWh`Y]hYb`ni `bi hnYbžX]Y`G]Y
Ua `UhhfU_hj` ghYb`Z]bXYbž]gh`Yg`Ub`XYf`NY]hžVYggYf`ni
j YfghY\Ybžk c`G]Y`Δ f`K]ggYb`j Yfh]YZYb`a ØggYb"
⇒Yb`h]Z]n]YfYb`G]Y`6ØW YfžZcfa Y``Y`i bX`]bZcfa Y``Y`?`i fgYž
: UWnYfh]Z_UhY`i bX`K YVg]hYgžX]Y`fY`Yj Ubh`g]bXž`i bX
d`UbYb`G]Yž`YXYb`HU[`Y]b`V]ggWYb`a Y\`f`ni ``YfbYb`8]Yg
hfÀ[h`b]WWh`bi f`ni `Δ f`Yf`; `Ui Vh ØfX][_Y]h`fl`bX`Δ f`Ya
GY`Vghj`YfhfUi`Yb`LVY]žgc bXYfb`a chj`]Yfh`G]Y`Ui W`VY]
Δ f`Yf`Gi W`Y`bUW`XYa`dYfZY`hYb`K Y["*
- *F Y]W k`Y]hY`i bX`Ni gUa a YbZUggi b[. :]bXYb`G]Y
gW`]Y»`]WWh` ; Ya Y]bgWUZhYb`i bX`A Ybhc`fYbža]h`XYbYb`G]Y
g]WWh`j`YfbYh`_ØbbYb`DYfgØb`]WWh`Y`i bX`C`b`]bY!
7ca a i b]h`Yg`_ØbbYb`Y]b`[fc`Ufh][Yf`C`f`g`Y]bž`i a`⇒YYb
Ui gni h`Ui gWWh`Ybž`A Ø[`]WWh`Y]hYb`ni `Z]bXYb`cXYf`9]bV`]WWh`]
XYb`j`cb`Δ bYb`[Yk À\`hYb`6Yfi Zni`Yf\`U`hYb`G]Y`Z]bXYb
a`Y\`f`Y`cb`]bYž]bgVYgcbXYfY`Ui`Z`GcWU`!`A`YX]U!
D`Uh`hZcfa`Yb`k`]Y`n`579!; fi ddYbZ]h` Ya`Y]bgWUZh`i`bX`X]Y
579`*<`YU`h`7cUW`B`Yh`n`Yf`_`A`Ybhc`fYb`g`]bX`j`]Y``Y]WWh`
Yh`Ug`gWWh`]Yf`[Yf`ni`Z]bXYbž`UVYf`Yg`_Ubb`Ai`»`Yfgh
\`ZfY]WWh`g`Y]bž`Y]bYb`YfZU\`fYb`Yb`DfcZ`ni`Z]bXYbž`XYf`j`cf
Δ bYb`Y]bYb`K`Y`[`YVU\`bh`U`h`]; Ubn`[`Y]WWh`cV`G]Y`Y]bYb
`bg]XYf`9]bV`]WWh`]b`XYb`ε`V`Yf\`U`hYbž`Δ bYb`X]Y`f]WWh`[Y
F]WWh`i`b[`ZØf`K`Y]hYfV`Xi`b[`cXYf`ni`gÀh`]WWh`Y**

≠bZcfa Uh]cbYb ni fJ cfVYfY]hi b['Ui ZX]Y F c``Y nY][Yb cXYf
ΔbYb gc[Uf'; YYXVUW_ ni ΔfYf' 5fVY]h[YYbZ'X]Y
Ni gUa a YbUfVY]h'a]h?c``Y[Yb]ghcZh'X]Y VYghY A Yh\cXY
XY]bYb K Y[ni Z]bXYb"

≠bgd]f]Yfh'j cb 579

8 YhU]`g

6 Ygi WX Yb G]Y i bg'Ui Z a Y]b!Z]hbYgg"bYh